Greater Manchester People's Panel for AI

Terms of Reference version 6.0, 4 April 2023

1. Background

The People's Panel for Artificial Intelligence (PPfAI) is designed to bring together a group of citizens to educate, upskill, learn about, discuss and give their views around the use of data and artificial intelligence in people's everyday lives. The Panel will debate the positive and negative consequences of new research ideas, products and/or services pitched to them by businesses and researchers and provide opinions and feedback from a wider perspective. The Panel is established to ensure that the voice of citizens in communities is heard and to empower them to have confidence in questioning the use of technology.

2. Purpose and Aims

The purpose of the People's Panel for Artificial Intelligence is to give citizens a voice. The panel is designed to:

- identify people's concerns and viewpoints about the use of AI in their everyday lives through interactions with products and services;
- provide a sounding board for new innovative business solutions and university-based research in Artificial Intelligence and Data Driven Technologies;
- engage in continuing dialogue with different communities about new technology.

This will be achieved through stimulating discussion between trained community panel members, businesses, and researchers in a formal panel setting.

A key benefit to businesses and researchers is an opportunity to think more widely about a technological project/idea and to develop and trial a non-technical way of communicating its benefits. The panels are ground-breaking in that they involve ordinary people from disengaged communities and give businesses an opportunity to reach out and explore ideas from a very different viewpoint.

Participation in the panel also aims to inspire researchers to develop ideas to help solve problems, using data and artificial intelligence, that are important to communities.

3. Scope

The People's Panel for Artificial Intelligence shall consider the following when making comments and recommendations:

a) Positive and Negative consequences of new ideas / research / product and services that use data and/or aspects of artificial intelligence.
b) Suggestions for the mitigations of negative consequences.
c) Impact on their own communities and beyond.

4. Process For Setting up a People's Panel for Artificial Intelligence (PPfAI)

4.1 Establishing a PPfAI Panel

A People's Panel for Artificial Intelligence can be established in communities within regions as follows:

1) Conducting AI Community Roadshows to raise awareness and give an opportunity for education/upskilling. The roadshow should be interactive and cover a) What is Artificial Intelligence and why does it matter? b) Examples of existing applications that use artificial intelligence in people's everyday lives c) case studies for debate d) introduce the People's Panel and what is involved.
2) Community member recruitment. Citizens interested in taking part are asked to sign up for two free AI and PPfAI training days. This might be at the end of a roadshow or through information provided on posters on display in community centres.
3) Training days. The panel requires 2 training days – typically running between 10am and 3pm with an hour for lunch. Training days are very interactive and allow debate and discussion from citizens.
   a. Training day 1 provides a deeper dive into a) Data b) How an AI model is built and learns from data through patterns c) Ethical AI (Bias, fairness, explainability, accountability) d) A risk-based approach to AI e) the law f) Consequence Scanning technique.
   b. Training Day 2 covers a) Practicing and applying the consequence scanning technique, b) Harms Modelling technique c) a practice panel (mock).
   c. At the end of each training day an evaluation is undertaken with panel members to allow discussion and reflection on the panel, their motivation and confidence in taking part.
4) PPfAI Membership: Once panellists have completed the training, they can then volunteer to take part in a PPfAI panel session.

4.2 PPfAI Panel Membership, Roles and Responsibilities

The People's Panel for AI will have the following membership:

- 2 independent facilitators (one to lead discussions, one to take notes).
- At least 5-6 trained PPfAI panellists should participate in each live panel. Panel members should be representative and be equal, diverse, and inclusive of society where possible.
- 1-2 presenters from the business or researchers.

4.2.1 Roles of panel members

- Facilitator – trained staff (e.g., from Manchester Metropolitan Univeristy) to make sure everything runs smoothly and to time. The facilitator is responsible for making notes during the panel session which includes recording questions from the panel, responses from the business/researcher and the elements of consequence scanning discussed by the panel. The facilitator will produce written feedback for the business/researcher (see 5.3).
- Panel Chair – represents the panel views to the business, reports discussions, evaluates the panel. This could be a facilitator or a member of the PPfAI.
- Panel Members – question the business/researcher, voice opinions during panel consequence scanning session, evaluate the panel.

- Business or Researcher – pitches their idea, answers panel questions, discusses consequence scanning and panel response, evaluates the panel.

4.3 Format of a PPfAI Panel Session

A formal panel session will take 2 hours. The format is shown below:

- 15 minutes - Welcome and Introductions (Panel and Business/ Researcher)
- 10 minutes - Aim and Objectives of the Panel and Agenda (Facilitator)
- 20 minutes - Business/ Researcher Pitch
- 10 minutes – Panel Q&A to the Business/ Researcher
- 25 minutes – Panel retire for Consequence Scanning and the discussion is documented by the Facilitator.
- 10 minutes – Panel feedback to Business/ Researcher provided by the Panel Chair
- 20 minutes – Business/ Researcher response and discussion
- 10 minutes – Evaluation and Close. At the end of the panel, an evaluation should be conducted with the business/researcher to consider changes to forthcoming panels.
- Following the panel session, written feedback is sent to the business/ researcher that includes questions raised by the panel, intended/ unintended consequences, positive consequences and suggestions for mitigations.
- Further questions and comments can be fed back to the business/researcher following reflection by panel members after the panel session via the facilitator.

After the panel session, the business/researcher will have the opportunity to feed back any changes to their processes, research or products based on suggestions of the panel by contacting the panel facilitator directly. The facilitator will then share information on these adjustments with the panel members to measure the longer-term impact of the PPfAI.

4.4 Advertisement of PPfAI

The PPfAI shall be advertised to both private and public sector organisations in the region by working with local media and councils.

5. People's Panel Meetings

5.1 Frequency of Panel Meetings

The People's Panel for AI will meet based on business and researcher demand.

5.2 Notes of Meetings

Records of attendees, discussions and feedback will be taken by the independent facilitator, with a summary provided back to panellists.

5.3 Written feedback

Following the panel, written feedback should be provided to the business /researcher within eight working days of the meeting. This should provide a summary of the questions raised by the panel, positive and negative consequences identified, suggested mitigations and recommendations.

6. Remuneration

It is the responsibility of the business/researcher (or facilitator on request) to book a suitable venue for panel members to take part in a PPfAI panel session and to make all reasonable adjustments for panel members to attend. Panel members can be expected to be renumerated as follows:

- Panel members travel costs to and from the venue. Reasonable adjustments should be made for all panellists.
- Refreshments and lunch should be provided during the PPfAI training days.
- Refreshments and/or lunch on PPfAI Panel Session days.
- Panellists will be renumerated or compensated for their time according to the current living wage (e.g., high street vouchers). This rate should be the same rate as a researcher within a univeristy and never less than the current living wage.
- Panel members can also request in advance renumeration for childcare support provided by approved childcare (e.g. registered childminder, nanny, playscheme, nursery or club) in accordance with UK Government current policy.

7. Ongoing upskilling

Once a year, there will be an opportunity for ongoing training for Panel members subject to funding. At each meeting of the People's Panel for AI, a dedicated time should be allocated for upskilling due to the advancement of technology and legal frameworks.

8. Sustainability of the panel

Not all trained panel members may be available for a PPfAI panel session. Trained panel members may rotate on PPfAI panels. New community members should have the opportunity to take part. The involvement of PPfAI panellists should be reviewed and agreed on an annual basis. Equality, diversity, and inclusivity of panel members is essential to hear representative voices of society.

9. Confidentiality

Comments from individual panellists will remain confidential. Panel discussions will be recorded as notes and reported to the business/researchers as comments from the collective panel. Presenters from businesses or researchers may wish to ask for a Non-Disclosure Agreement to be signed by those in attendance.

10. Evaluation and Review

Trained PPfAI panellists will meet approximately 4 times each year to discuss how the panel is progressing, raise concerns, and updates for future training. Adjustments by businesses/researchers based on feedback from the panel sessions will be curated subject to informed consent of all parties.

The outcomes of the People's Panel for AI will be evaluated by all citizens every 12 months and the Terms of Reference will be reviewed every 12 months.

This document was co-produced by panel members, businesses and researchers involved in the People's Panel for AI project, led by Dr Annabel Latham and Prof Keeley Crockett